#### **AGENDA**

#### Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

Date: July 27, 2005
Time: 1:30 p.m. (EST)
Location: Conference Room A

Indiana Government Conference Center

402 W. Washington Street Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

#### Call to Order

Approval of the April 27, 2005 meeting's minutes

- I. Division Director's Report
- II. State Certificates of Approval
  - 1. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval continued from the April 27, 2005 meeting for the demolition of the Apple and Orchard Houses at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.
  - 2. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Museum and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to alter the façades of the Indiana Territory Capitol in Vincennes, Knox County, Indiana.
  - 3. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by repairing storm damage, the Bronnenberg House at Mounds State Park, Union Township, Madison County, Indiana.
  - 4. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs, for a certificate of approval to alter, by replacing and installing interpretative signs, Mounds State Park, Union Township, Madison County, Indiana.
  - 5. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Engineering, for a certificate of approval to alter, by replacing the lower window sashes with louvers, the house at the Shrader-Weaver Homestead, in the Shrader-Weaver Nature Preserve, near Bentonville in Fayette County, Indiana.
  - 6. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Engineering, for a certificate of approval to alter, by waterproofing the foundation and improving drainage, the house at the Shrader-Weaver Homestead, in the Shrader-Weaver Nature Preserve, near Bentonville in Fayette County, Indiana.

# III. National Register Applications

- 1. Jerman School, 031-252-24021, 316 W. Walnut Street, Greensburg, Decatur County ((1783)
- 2. Speedway Historic District, roughly bounded by 16th Street, Main St., 10th St., Winton Ave., Speedway, Marion County (1796)
- 3. Ft. Wayne Street Bridge, Indiana Avenue over the Elkhart River, Goshen, Elkhart County (1808)
- 4. George Boxley Cabin, Pioneer Hill at First and Main Streets, Sheridan, Hamilton County (1813)
- 5. Kingsbury-Doak Farmhouse, 089-095-95007, 4411 E. 153<sup>rd</sup> Ave. Hebron, Lake County (1819)
- 6. Abijah O'Neall II House, 107-139-40006, 4040 W. 300 S, Crawfordsville, Montgomery County (1825)
- 7. Grace Keiser Maring Library, 035-442-45308, 1808 S. Madison St., Muncie, Delaware County (1826)
- 8. Indiana Harbor Public Library, 089-679-33017, 3605 Grand Avenue, East Chicago, Lake County (1827)
- 9. Blankenship-Hodges-Brown Hs., 109-050-51023, 7455 Old State Road 67 W., Paragon, Morgan County (1834)

#### IV. Grant Evaluation Criteria and Priorities for FY 2006 Historic Preservation Fund Grants

#### V. Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification

## Listed

Cataract Covered Bridge, At the intersection of CR 235W and CR1000N over Mill Creek in Leiber State Recreation Area, Cataract vic., Owen County (1657)

Joseph Jackson Hotel, 071-641-51011, 2720 Main Street, Vallonia, Jackson County (1798)

Honeywell Studio, 169-652-20011, 378 State Road 15, Wabash, Wabash County (1799)

Vinegar Hill Historic District, 105-055-77000, both sides of E. 1st St. from Woodlawn to Jordan and S. Sheridan to E. Maxwell, Bloomington, Monroe County (1801)

Twelve Points Historic District, 167-628-24001-24026, Lafayette Ave from Linden to 13th St & Maple Ave from Garfield to 13th St., Terre Haute, Vigo County (1804)

Kokomo High School and Memorial Gymnasium, 067-323-46142, 067-323-46143, 303 East Superior Street and 400 Apperson Way North, Kokomo, Howard County (1806)

Christopher Souder House, 183-510-16028, 214 W. Main Street, Larwill, Whitley County (1809)

Old Union Church and Cemetery, 027-008-45018, 1125 E, Alfordsville vicinity, Daviess County (1810)

Martin County Courthouse, 220 Capital Avenue, Shoal, Martin County (1811)

Lake County Sanatorium Nurses Home, 089-142-65068, 2323 North Main Street, Crown Point, Lake County (1816)

Andrew Nicholson Farmstead, 083-675-35021, 12095 SR 550, Wheatland, Knox County (1818)

## Rejected

Hotel Barton, 501-509 N. Delaware Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1800)

Froebel School, 089-232-20537, West 15th Street and Madison Street, Gary, Lake County (1822)

# VII. Set date for the next meeting

Proposed date: October 19, 2005, Indiana Government Conference Room A, 1:30 p.m. (EST)

TO: Members of the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

FROM: Jon Smith, Director, Division of Historic Preservation & Archaeology

DATE: July 7, 2005

SUBJECT: Staff comments for items on the July 27, 2005 Agenda

## II. State Certificates of Approval

1. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval continued from the April 27, 2005 meeting for the demolition of the Apple and Orchard Houses at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is a follow-up to the request submitted for the April 28, 2004, January 26, 2005, and April 27, 2005 Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board meetings. During the April 2004 and January meetings, the request was tabled with the Review Board recommendation that if the Indiana Department of Correction wished to pursue demolition, information about the structural problems of these buildings be provided.

Because the jurisdiction of the Review Board had previously been invoked, and the Board had initiated a review of the certificate of approval applications under IC § 14-21-1-18, DHPA staff did not believe it had the authority to dismiss the certificate of approval application on its own. Therefore, at the April 27, 2005 meeting, the certificate of approval request was tabled for a third time to seek guidance from the Department of Natural Resources' legal staff and to determine if the Review Board still had jurisdiction over the project.

On February 11, 2005, DHPA staff members Frank Hurdis and Karie Brudis made a site visit to the Plainfield Juvenile Correctional Facility with Bill Beinart, Director of Architectural and Engineering Services with the Indiana Department of Correction. As a result of observations made during that site visit, DHPA staff concluded that the Indiana Boy's School Historic District was no longer eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures due to loss of integrity as a result of various changes that have occurred to the district since 1998, when the DHPA staff had previously evaluated it for an unrelated project. Furthermore, the staff determined that neither the Apple House nor the Orchard House by themselves are significant enough to be eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures. If the buildings and the district are not eligible, then they no longer would be considered historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because historic sites or structures owned by the State would not be demolished by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the State, the staff has determined that a certificate of approval need not be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18, for the Department of Correction's proposed project.

Because a certificate of approval is not needed for the demolition of the Apple House and the Orchard House. Therefore, we recommend that the vote to remove the matter from consideration.

2. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Museum and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to alter the façades of the Indiana Territory Capitol in Vincennes, Knox County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II-2. A completed form was received by the Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology ("DHPA") on June 15, 2005, from Kathleen McLary, Executive Vice President, Indiana State Museums & Historic Sites.

The Indiana Territory Capitol was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on July 2, 1973 and the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on July 12, 1972. Additionally, it is a contributing resource within the Vincennes Historic District, which was listed in the National Register on December 31, 1974 and the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on October 28, 1974. Therefore, we recognize that the Indiana Territory Capitol is historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18

Because a historic structure owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes the 1) changing of the window and door scheme, 2) installation of beaded wood clapboard siding, and the 3) construction of a wood staircase on the northwest side.

As the Indiana Territory Capitol has been extensively altered since it was used by the Indiana Territorial Government in 1811, and supporting documentation does not clearly indicate all of the proposed changes existed in 1811, the DHPA considers the proposed alterations to be more of a rehabilitation than a restoration. However we believe the proposed scope of work will not diminish the qualities that make the Indiana Territory Capitol historic.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.2 as its findings.

3. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter, by repairing storm damage, the Bronnenberg House at Mounds State Park, Union Township, Madison County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.3. A completed application form was received by the DHPA on June 17, 2005, from James Davis, Assistant Property Manager at Mounds State Park.

The Frederick Bronnenberg House was identified in the Brown County Interim Report, Indiana Survey of Historic Sites and Structures, and for the purposes of that survey, it was assigned site # 095-409-50009. The Frederick Bronnenberg House is a contributing property within Mounds State Park, which was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on January 18, 1973. As such, we recognize that the Frederick Bronnenberg House is historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

Because a historic structure owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes the 1) cleaning and reinstallation of broken sections of the brick chimney, 2) reconstruction of missing soffit material, 3) replacement of one square foot of cedar shakes, and the 4) replacement of 42' of copper guttering and one downspout.

As the Division of State Parks and Reservoirs proposes replace damaged or missing material (i.e., soffit, cedar shakes, copper gutters) with in-kind material, reconstruct the brick chimney to its original condition using the salvaged bricks, and follow the recommendations of *Preservation Briefs #2: Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Brick Buildings*, the DHPA staff has no concerns or recommendations regarding the scope of work as currently proposed.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.3 as its findings.

4. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs, for a certificate of approval to alter, by replacing and installing interpretative signs, Mounds State Park, Union Township, Madison County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment I.4. A completed application form was received by the DHPA on June 17, 2005, from Jody Heaston, Interpretive Naturalist at Mounds State Park.

Mounds State Park was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on January 18, 1973. Established in 1930, the park contains and preserves some of the finest examples of earthwork and mound building in the state. The earthwork complex at the park has been investigated archaeologically since the late 1960s, and many unique discoveries have been made as a result. This is an outstanding Adena-Hopewell site with the largest mound dating to circa 160 B.C. As such, we recognize that the Mounds State Park is historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

Because a historic site owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The project will enhance the public's experience at the property because the existing outdated interpretive wooden signs will be replaced and new wayside interpretive signs at five earthworks will provide visitors with accurate, up to date information regarding our understanding of the archaeological site. The text of interpretive signage has been designed in consultation with professional archaeologists.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item I.4. The staff further recommends that, if a certificate of approval is granted, the Board condition the certificate on the following:

- 1. Proper citations for the images (and any relevant portions of the text) which are utilized should be included on the signs.
- 2. Because there is the possibility that archaeological deposits may be altered, demolished, or removed by the sign placements, archaeological investigations will be necessary at any areas which will be affected by ground disturbing activities during the course of the project. A proposal for this level of archaeological investigations by a qualified archaeologist (meeting the standards in 312 IAC 21) will need to be submitted to the DHPA for review and comment prior to ground disturbing activities, per Indiana Code (IC) 14-21-1.
- 3. If archaeological deposits are encountered, the DHPA will be notified, and further archaeological investigations will take places as necessary after consultation with the DHPA.
- 4. Archaeological reports for all phases of archaeological work conducted will be submitted to the DHPA for review and comment prior to project commencement.
- 5. Also, be advised that if any archaeological artifacts or human remains are uncovered during project activities, state law (IC 14-21-1-27 and 29) requires that the discovery must be reported to the Department of Natural Resources within two (2) business days.
- 6. Any proposed revisions to the plans for placement of the signs must be submitted in writing to the Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology prior to implementation.
- 5. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Engineering, for a certificate of approval to alter, by replacing lower window sashes with louvers, the house at the Shrader-Weaver Homestead, in the Shrader-Weaver Nature Preserve, near Bentonville in Fayette County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.5. A completed form was received by the DHPA on June 17, 2005, from Bogumila Dabrowska, Division of Engineering.

The DHPA staff believes that the Shrader-Weaver Homestead--consisting of the main, two-story house (built ca. 1830, with a frame addition from ca. 1870), a barn, and a few other, smaller outbuildings—is eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures and the National Register of Historic Places, due to its association with the settlement period of Indiana history and is, consequently, historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because a historic structure owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The proposed project, which the Division of Engineering calls "Correcting Humidity Problems at Homestead—Phase I," has two, principle components: replacement of the lower window sashes with louvers to improve ventilation during the mothballing of the house and removal of non-historic roof gutters and repair of the fascia and rake, as needed. The window sashes that are so removed would be stored within the house, on the second floor. These treatments appear to the DHPA staff appear to be appropriate interim measures, and the staff has no disagreement with them.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.5 as its findings.

6. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Engineering, for a certificate of approval to alter, by waterproofing the foundation and improving drainage, the house at the Shrader-Weaver Homestead, in the Shrader-Weaver Nature Preserve, near Bentonville in Fayette County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.6. A completed form was received by the DHPA on June 17, 2005, from Bogumila Dabrowska, Division of Engineering.

The DHPA staff believes that the Shrader-Weaver Homestead--consisting of the main, two-story house (built ca. 1830, with a frame addition from ca. 1870), a barn, and a few other, smaller outbuildings—is eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures and the National Register of Historic Places, due to its association with the settlement period of Indiana history and is, consequently, "historic," as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because a historic structure owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The proposed project, which the Division of Engineering calls "Correcting Humidity Problems at Homestead—Phase 2," appears to consist of four, principle components: replacement of the fill in the builder's trench and installation of perimeter drains around the foundation, application of a waterproofing material to the exteriors of the foundation walls, improving the slope of the soil in an area extending 10 feet outward from the foundation, and installation of a polyethylene vapor barrier on the cellar floor.

For any areas on the exterior of the house where excavation and grading will occur, archaeological investigations by a qualified professional archaeologist (with a systematic plan or permit approved by the Department of Natural Resources) are required to determine the presence or absence of archaeological deposits. The investigations should include shovel probes systematically excavated around the exterior of the house, the perimeter drain areas, and the grading areas. Also, a historical background and records check should be conducted. The exposed portions of the brick/stone area on the southeast area of the house also must be recorded by a qualified professional archaeologist. If archaeological deposits are encountered, the DHPA will be notified and further archaeological investigations, including intensive archaeological reconnaissance, test excavations, and/or mitigation will take place as necessary after consultation with the DHPA. Archaeological reports for all phases of archaeological work conducted will be submitted to the DHPA for review and comment prior to project development.

Also, be advised that if any archaeological artifacts or human remains are uncovered during construction, demolition, or earthmoving activities, state law (Indiana Code 14-21-1-27 and 29) requires that the discovery must be reported to the Department of Natural Resources within two (2) business days.

While the application of a waterproofing material will change the appearance of the foundation walls, it does not seem likely that this change would remain visible once the builder's trench is refilled. The alternative materials proposed for the waterproofing appear to the DHPA staff to be appropriate. The change in the grade of the soil around the house to improve surface drainage of water may be noticeable to someone familiar with the property in its current condition, but it does not appear likely to detract from the historic character of the house or of the other structures and features of the historic farmstead.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item I.6 as its findings. The staff further recommends that, if a certificate of approval is granted, the Board condition the certificate on satisfactory completion of archaeological investigations and reports recommended above.

#### III. State and National Register Applications

## 1. Jerman School, 031-252-24021, Decatur County (1783)

Jerman School received a preliminary determination of individual listing (PDIL) from the National Park Service, for purposes of a certified rehabilitation under the Investment Tax Credit program. The developer rehabilitated the school according to the secretary of the interior's standards. The new use, senior housing, preserves many of the original and historic features of the building. Staff believes that the school meets the registration requirements established in the "Indiana's Public Common and High Schools" multiple property documentation form. Approval is recommended for the State and National Registers under Criteria A and C, local significance.

# 2. Speedway Historic District, roughly bounded by 16th, Main, 10th and Winton, Speedway, Marion County (1796)

The Wayne Township, Marion County Interim Report, 1993, did not identify a historic district in Speedway. It did individually identify a number of the buildings and houses included in this district. Staff believes that a preponderance of evidence outweighs the survey recommendation, however. A staff site visit, coupled with field work by Speedway Junior High students, identified a concentration of historic buildings within the original plat that are associated with the development of the community as well-recognized industrial suburb. Further research confirmed the ties of the community to a broader picture of industrialization. Based on this, staff recommended that the nomination concentrate on criterion A (historical association) rather than C (architecture; the typical focus of a survey project). Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, under Criterion A, statewide significance.

#### 3. Fort Wayne Street Bridge, Indiana Avenue over Elkhart River, Elkhart County (1808)

This 180 foot steel truss bridge is rare and significant in several ways. First, it is one of only seven Pennsylvania through-truss metal bridges left in the state (only four of which are highway bridges, the remainder are rail spans). The bridge served a main road connecting the two largest cities in the county, Elkhart and Goshen. Staff feels that the bridge meets National Register Criteria A and C, and has statewide significance. Staff further recommends approval for the State and National Registers.

# 4. George Boxley Cabin, Pioneer Hill at First and Main Streets, Sheridan, Hamilton County (1813)

The Boxley Cabin, built about 1828, is associated with the pioneer credited to be Adams Township's first settler. It is the oldest remaining building on land later platted as the Town of Sheridan. As the nomination indicates, Boxley operated a school on the property and so was important to early efforts at education in the township. Boxley's activities that led him to flee Virginia as a fugitive, while important to his biography and the early history of anti-slavery, predate his Indiana years and so have no association with the cabin.

The cabin sits on land owned by the Town of Sheridan and is currently being restored by the Sheridan Historical Society to commemorate Boxley's local importance. When the society took on the project, the cabin already was seriously deteriorated so their efforts have been directed to protect as much of what remains as possible while determining the best way to see their vision realized. This accounts for the different states of the building in the photography. The earliest photos show the building clapboard sided and with its damaged slate roof still in place. More recent photos record the progress to remove later accretions and prepare the cabin for restoration. The Sheridan Historical Society has contracted with a craftsman to accomplish the restoration; his proposal has been included with the nomination.

The local significance of the building is unquestioned and the effort to restore it to as close to its historical appearance as possible must be applauded. From the perspective of National Register listing, the issue is integrity. The nomination preparer has indicated that about two thirds of the building Boxley knew remains, most of which appears salvageable. If the Board is comfortable with the building's current physical integrity, they should approve the cabin as locally significant under Criteria A and B. The staff recommends that a motion to nominate should include the requirement that once the restoration is complete, additional documentation of final condition and appearance on National Register continuation sheets be submitted to update the file.

## 5. Kingsbury-Doak Farmhouse, 089-352-95007, Lake County (1819)

The 1996 Lake County Interim Report, Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory, rated this farmhouse "notable." Staff has concluded that the house meets Criterion C as one of the best examples of Italianate architecture in rural Eagle Creek Township of Lake County. Two other houses of similar style in the township were rated "notable," a total of three properties in all were so rated. Since no properties were rated "outstanding" in the township, the Kingsbury-Doak House is among the highest rated houses in the township. Furthermore, the house is significant for its remarkably intact woodwork, a fact not typically revealed in survey work. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, local significance.

## 6. Abijah O'Neall II House, 107-139-40006, Montgomery County (1825)

This house meets Criterion C as one of the best remaining examples of a vernacular Federal era I-house in Montgomery County. The 1986 Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory, Montgomery County Interim Report rated the house "outstanding." Staff gave consideration to requesting further research on the underground railroad / abolition connection of the property, however, further attempts by staff and the owner to gather information were taking a significant amount of time. Several time factors are also pressing. The owner is undertaking a state homeowner tax credit project, and the house is deteriorating. Therefore, staff has nominated the building under Criterion C only, with the understanding that the owner may choose to add information to the nomination at a later date. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, local significance.

## 7. Grace Keiser Maring Library, 035-442-45308, Delaware County (1826)

The Certified Local Government (Muncie Historic Preservation and Rehabilitation Commission) in Muncie, Indiana, has forwarded this application to the board for consideration. The building was rated

"outstanding" in the Delaware County Interim Report of 1985. Staff agrees that the library meets National Register Criteria A and C, for its role as the first branch library in Muncie that served a significant portion of the population. Architecturally, the building is significant as one of few surviving public buildings by a locally significant firm. Additionally, the style of the building (Colonial Revival) is less typical for a public library, as explained in the nomination. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, local significance.

#### 8. Indiana Harbor Public Library, 089-679-33017, Lake County (1827)

Like the preceding application, this building is now vacant and non-profit entity hopes to use National Register listing as part of a revitalization campaign. Unlike the Muncie example, however, this building has been damaged by water penetration, though, staff feels that it retains most of its character-defining elements. The Lake County Interim Report rated the library "notable." Staff recommends approval for the National Register, based on the information presented in the application. The building meets Criteria A and C. The building is historically significant as one of two Carnegie-funded public libraries in the area; it served the rapidly growing East Chicago – Indiana Harbor community as a significant educational institution for decades. The architecture of the library is significant as a good example of the Arts & Crafts style, seldom used for public buildings, but, popular for Carnegie-funded libraries in Indiana. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, local significance.

#### 9. Blankenship-Hodges-Brown House, 109-050-51023, Morgan County (1834)

This c.1875 house was rated "notable" in the Morgan County Interim Report. It stands out in the town of Paragon because of its size and as the best example of Queen Anne architecture with Stick/Eastlake details. There are similarities between this house and those illustrated in pattern books by Palliser, Palliser and Company. However, Philip Blankenship, a Paragon lumberman, personalized this house. As many as 17 different kinds of wood are used on the interior. The Blankenship-Hodges-Brown House is eligible for the State and National Registers under Criterion C for its architecture (local significance).